

University of Groningen

Getting down to brass tacks: Is your organization really aligned?

Ullrich, Kristoph

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:

2017

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Ullrich, K. (2017). *Getting down to brass tacks: Is your organization really aligned?* [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. University of Groningen, SOM research school.

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

Getting Down to Brass Tacks: Is Your Organization Really Aligned?

Kristoph K. R. Ullrich

Publisher: University of Groningen
Groningen
The Netherlands

Printed by: Ipskamp Drukkers B.V.

ISBN: 978-90-367-9166-3
978-90-367-9167-0 (e-book)

© 2016 Kristoph K. R. Ullrich

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system of any nature, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying or recording, without prior written permission of the author.



**rijksuniversiteit
 groningen**

Getting Down to Brass Tacks: Is Your Organization Really Aligned?

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de
Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de
rector magnificus prof. dr. E. Sterken
en volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties.

De openbare verdediging zal plaatsvinden op
maandag 6 februari 2017 om 12.45 uur

door

Kristoph Kurt Reinhard Ullrich

geboren op 21 januari 1987
te Mönchengladbach, Duitsland

Promotores

Prof. dr. R. H. Teunter

Prof. dr. S. Transchel

Beoordelingscommissie

Prof. dr. M. Kremer

Prof. dr. D. P. van Donk

Prof. dr. G. Voigt

To my family

Acknowledgments

This thesis is the result of a long journey on which many fabulous people accompanied me, helping me to arrive at my chosen destination. This group of people – who inspired me to follow my dreams, helped me to stay on track and guided me so I would not lose sight of my goal, who encouraged me to climb even the highest mountains and not simply pass them by, who backed me up on stormy days, and who somehow managed to make the entire journey a great joy – consists of my supervisors, colleagues, friends, and my family. If I hadn't had all of your great support I would still not know where, when, and how my journey would be coming to an end – I am greatly thankful to each of you.

First and foremost, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisors, prof. dr. Sandra Transchel and prof. dr. Ruud H. Teunter. Sandra, you guided me through my master's thesis at Kühne Logistics University and later invited me to pursue my PhD under joint supervision with Ruud at the University of Groningen. During this time, you gave me the freedom and trust to explore topics and methodologies on my own while providing support, guidance and advice whenever I needed them. I am convinced that your supervision method provided the ideal conditions under which I could personally and professionally develop the skills required in academia to contribute further to the scientific community. I enjoyed our meetings, long discussions and interchange of ideas, sometimes more and sometimes less research-focused. Sandra, I learned a lot from you and I consider

myself very lucky to have worked with you: thank you.

Ruud, as my promoter at the University of Groningen you took on a very special responsibility for me. Although I mostly worked from my office in Hamburg, you always made me feel like a full member of the group. Whenever I sent you an e-mail seeking advice, it was as impressive as it was inspiring for me to see how quickly you understand complex problems and the speed with which you managed to respond to my requests. I enjoyed working with you very much and I learned a lot during our joint research project. Alongside the academic support that you provided, you handled all sorts of bureaucratic issues with regard to university admission and the like for me, which gave me more time and energy to focus on research. I am deeply thankful for your guidance and the knowledge you shared with me – thank you, Ruud.

I would also like to thank the members of the reading committee, prof. dr. Mirko Kremer, prof. dr. Dirk Pieter van Donk, and prof. dr. Guido Voigt, for your willingness to spend your precious time reading my dissertation. Your evaluation, valuable comments and insights are very much appreciated.

In addition to my supervisors and the reading committee, during the past years I have had the great fortune to have many other academic mentors who I would also like to thank for their support. The list below is certainly incomplete and the words are too few to express my full appreciation. Nevertheless, I will mention a few of the people who have been very helpful in recent years, and ask the ones whose names I have overlooked to forgive my omission. I will address you in no specific order.

To start, I would like to thank prof. dr. Stephan M. Wagner from the Swiss Federal Institute of Technology in Zurich, who is the co-author of my first publication. Stephan, our joint work right after I received my master's degree confirmed my resolution to pursue a PhD and was a perfect opportunity to learn about the publishing process. It was a great pleasure to work with you. I would also like to express my sincere gratitude to dr. Jasper Veldman from the University of Groningen. Jasper co-authored Chapter 4 of this thesis and made a major contribution to the research progress despite being busy with his research visit at the University

of Sydney during that time. Thank you very much for your support, Jasper. Prof. dr. Nagesh Gavirneni from Cornell University also deserves my deepest gratitude. Nagesh provided constructive feedback for some of my research projects, we had stimulating conversations covering all sorts of topics (with a focus on Indian TV series), and he connected me with prof. dr. Vishal Gaur (Cornell University) to put my foot in the door of the empirical workshop in operations management at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania in which I participated in 2015. Nagesh, the workshop was a fantastic experience and literally changed my life in many ways – thank you so much for being my gatekeeper!

During this workshop I met many nice people with whom I am still in contact; but there was one person who became a friend, a collaborator for ongoing research projects, and who provided helpful feedback for the empirical papers that are part of this dissertation. Prof. dr. Sriram Narayanan from Michigan State University (MSU), whom I visited in East Lansing, MI/USA in January/February 2016, has earned my complete gratitude. Sriram, you made me feel home during my time in the States. I enjoyed all of our fruitful academic and philosophical discussions, the joint dinners with you and your family, and our way of collaboration. Thank you very much for your support in many regards and I hope that we can combine one of our ongoing projects with another visit to MSU. I would also like to thank prof. dr. Vinod R. Singhal from Georgia Institute of Technology for the feedback that he provided me for most of my research projects, the great conversations that we had at operations management conferences, and the spontaneous meeting combined with a traditional Chinese lunch in Shanghai, where I spent one semester as visiting scholar at Tongji University. Vinod – thank you very much for your helpful support. I had an amazing time in Shanghai, where I completed my single-author paper (cp. Chapter 3) and learned a lot about the different cultures there while enjoying life as an expat. Prof. dr. Sidong Zhang from Tongji University made my visit to Shanghai possible and although we did not find the time for research collaboration, Sidong was always more than supportive. Thank you, Sidong, for having made this enriching experience possible for me.

Thanks to all of the professors at Kühne Logistics University, who are always available for questions and provide support whenever required. In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to prof. dr. Kai Hoberg, who sparked my interest in the analysis of secondary financial data. And I would like to thank prof. dr. Christian Tröster for his kind support while I was writing my master's thesis and throughout the PhD.

My research would not have gone as smoothly as planned without the support and policy-making staff at the Kühne Logistics University. In particular, Birgit Kappert and Melanie Winkelmann receive my gratitude for their patient assistance with respect to administrative issues. I also greatly appreciate the generous four-year scholarship that Kühne Logistics University awarded me. It enabled me to focus entirely on my research and attend major operations management conferences and doctoral courses around the globe. Participating in these conferences and courses helped me to develop further personally and professionally, and also connected me with many amazing people. Guys, you made my attendance at each of the conferences and workshops a great joy and I consider myself very lucky to have had the chance to get to know so many wonderful people. I cannot list all of your names but will be sure to express my appreciation for you and your delightful company with at least one drink at our next encounter.

A very special thanks goes out to my friend and colleague Christoph Flöthmann. Christoph and I began the PhD program at the same time and since then we have spent most of our leisure and professional time together. This includes many unforgettable nights in the Reeperbahn district and participation in most of the conferences and doctoral courses. Christoph, without you and your good spirits, my time as a PhD student would certainly not have been half as joyous. I thank you for the amazing time that we have spent together – sometimes more and sometimes less intoxicated (as you would say: "It is hard to stand on one leg.") – and I am glad to have you as a friend. Christoph, I consider myself very lucky that you agreed to be my paranymph and that you continue to support me.

I also owe my office-mate, colleague and friend, Florian Badorf, much gratitude.

I am not exaggerating when I say that Florian was the best mentor for econometric programming that I can think of and he made an essential contribution to the realization of my research projects. Whether he was providing STATA support, challenging assumptions, listening to my complaints, making jokes with his dry sense humor, having a fitting Simpsons quote on hand and making fun of me because I do not know the series, joining me to ensure I had a constant and copious caffeine supply, or simply by arranging pub crawls that usually resolved all my fears and problems at least for a few hours, Florian made a massive contribution to my dissertation. Florian, thank you for your outstanding encouragement!

I am deeply grateful to all my other colleagues at Kühne Logistics University and the University of Groningen for the fruitful discussions, kind support and the great parties that we had. Each of you is exceptional and all together you made my time as PhD student an unforgettable experience.

Most importantly, my heartfelt thanks go to all my family members and especially my parents, who always believed in me, encouraged me to follow my dreams, inspired me to accept challenges, and taught me to never give up. None of this would have been possible without your endless love and support, and there is no way I could ever repay you for being my source of energy and optimism. I dedicate this work to my family, with my full appreciation for their endless encouragement and the hope that the things that I do make them proud. Finally, although she is also part of my family, I would like to particularly express my gratitude to my girlfriend Julie Knauer, who accompanied me along the ups and downs of my journey and whose encouragement, quiet patience, unlimited dedication and unwavering love also equipped me with the power and determination I needed to arrive at my chosen destination. Julie, I am very glad that you agreed to be my paranymp and that you will stand beside me on this special day.

Kristoph Ullrich
Hamburg, december 2016

Contents

Acknowledgments	i
List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Motivation	1
1.2 Scope of the Thesis	5
1.3 Outline	8
2 The Game Plan for Aligning the Organization	19
2.1 Introduction	20
2.2 About the Research	22
2.3 Sales and Operations Planning (S&OP)	23
2.3.1 Background	23
2.3.2 The S&OP Process: How to Balance Supply and Demand . . .	25
2.4 The Benefits of S&OP	28
2.5 A Maturity Model for Aligning the Organization	30

2.6	Empirical Assessment	42
2.7	What Happened at Geistlich Pharma?	44
2.8	Implications and Discussion	46
3	You Get What You Pay For: CEO Compensation and the Inventory Rhombus	49
3.1	Introduction	50
3.2	Literature Review	52
3.2.1	CEO Compensation and Managerial Decision Making	53
3.2.2	Empirical OM Literature	54
3.3	Conceptual Framework and Hypotheses	56
3.3.1	The Inventory Rhombus	57
3.3.2	Executive Compensation and Inventory Investment	59
3.4	Methodology	63
3.4.1	Description of the Data	63
3.4.2	Variable Operationalization	64
3.4.3	Model Specification	69
3.5	Results	72
3.5.1	Original Model	72
3.5.2	Robustness Tests	82
3.6	Implications and Discussion	88
4	Multi-Agent Salesforce Compensation with Supply Chain Considerations	93
4.1	Introduction	94
4.2	Literature Review	96
4.3	Model Formulation	101
4.4	Model Analysis	105
4.4.1	In-Advance Inventory Allocation (IA)	105
4.4.2	On-Demand Inventory Access (OD)	107
4.5	Numerical Analyses	114

Contents

4.5.1	OD Inventory Access versus IA Inventory Allocation	115
4.5.2	Demand Censorship versus Perfect Observability of Demand	118
4.5.3	The Value of Contracting	122
4.6	Conclusion	124
4.A	Proofs of Propositions	127
4.B	Impact of Demand Censorship Under the Optimal Supply Chain Design	131
5	Demand-Supply Mismatches and Stock Market Performance: A Retailing Perspective	133
5.1	Introduction	134
5.2	Research Setup	138
5.2.1	Relative Inventory Productivity Volatility Measure (DSM)	138
5.2.2	Data Description	144
5.2.3	Portfolio Formation	150
5.3	DSM and Stock Market Performance	151
5.3.1	Portfolio Excess Returns	151
5.3.2	Portfolio Adjustment for Common Risk Factors	153
5.3.3	Distinctiveness of DSM	155
5.4	Explanations of the Market Anomaly	163
5.5	Conclusion	169
5.A	The Effect of Ordering Frequency on DSM	172
5.B	Computation of AIG and AIT	172
5.C	Estimation Results After Shifting of the Portfolio Formation Date	175
6	Conclusion	177
	Bibliography	185
	Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch)	201

List of Figures

1.1	Key contributions of this thesis	7
2.1	Alignment of plans through S&OP	26
2.2	The S&OP process	27
2.3	S&OP maturity model	31
2.4	Comparison of actual performance and importance ratings	43
3.1	The inventory rhombus	58
3.2	The effects of SSP and SSV on inventory investment	89
4.1	Absolute difference in equilibrium effort between OD-C and IA-C . .	115
4.2	Absolute difference in inventory and service levels between OD-C and IA-C	116
4.3	Percentage difference in profit between OD-C and IA-C	118
4.4	Absolute difference in inventory and service levels between OD-C and OD-NC	120
4.5	Profit loss from demand censorship under the optimal bonus contract	122

4.6	The relationship between market conditions and the optimal supply chain design	125
4.7	Impact of demand censorship on the stocking quantity and the service level under the optimal supply chain design	131
5.1	Inventory turnover, DSM, and average stock returns of Sears Holdings Corp.	145
5.2	Sequence of events	151
5.3	Average excess returns of zero-cost portfolios based on DSM	153

List of Tables

1.1	Summary of chapters 2 to 5	17
2.1	Sample demographics	24
2.2	Benefits of S&OP	29
2.3	High-level description of S&OP maturity model	34
2.4	Self-assessed S&OP maturity of the sample firms	42
3.1	Summary statistics	69
3.2	Model estimates	76
3.3	Indirect and total effects of SSP and SSV on inventory investment . .	80
3.4	Summary of robustness checks	84
3.5	Estimation results from the single-equation relative inventory model	87
4.1	Structure of compensation schemes contingent on the supply chain design and demand observability	104
5.1	Example of DSM	142
5.2	Sample description	148
5.3	Descriptive statistics	149

5.4	Average monthly excess returns of quintile and zero-cost portfolios based on DSM	152
5.5	Fama-French-Carhart four factor regression results for zero-cost and quintile portfolios	156
5.6	Percentage overlap of portfolio ranks formed on alternative metrics and z-statistics	157
5.7	Correlation matrix	158
5.8	Fama and MacBeth (1973) approach: Average slopes and t-statistics from monthly cross-sectional regressions	161
5.9	Relationship between DSM and one-year-ahead earnings and one-year-ahead sales	165
5.10	Longitudinal portfolio performance benchmarked against the Fama-French-Carhart factors	167
5.11	Percentage of firms switching from portfolio ranks 1 or 2 in year t to portfolio ranks 4 or 5 in subsequent years	168
5.12	Responsiveness and the coefficient of variation of inventory turnover	173
5.13	Fama-French-Carhart four factor regression results for zero-cost and quintile portfolios using December 31 of $t - 1$ as cutoff date for portfolio formation	176